In the name of Allah, Most Gracious, Most Merciful

Assalaamu `alaykum waRahmatullahi Wabarakatuh

In the recent past the issue regarding dua after salah has been the subject of many discussions. Below is a brief explanation on this issue. This issue could be divided in four parts:

1. Dua after salah.
2. Raising the hands in dua.
3. Adhkaar and dua’s to be recited after salah.

The subject of debate relates more to the fourth topic. Therefore, hereunder we shall discuss the first three topics very briefly and then elaborate on the fourth point.

Dua after salah:

Our illustrious Fuqaha have clearly mentioned that it is mustahab to make dua after salah. There are many narrations that support this. Below we shall just mention one such narration:

Maulana Abdul Hayy Lucknowi mentions:

"From amongst those actions that should be done after salah is to make dua. Allama Shurunbulali mentions in Nurul Idah: then (after salah) they (the musali’s) whilst lifting their hands should make dua for themselves and for the general Muslim public. After dua they should wipe their hands over their faces.” (al Si’aya 2/257 Suhail academy)

Raising hand in dua:

“From amongst those actions that should be done after salah is to make dua. Allama Shurunbulali mentions in Nurul Idah: then (after salah) they (the musali’s) whilst lifting their hands should make dua for themselves and for the general Muslim public. After dua they should wipe their hands over their faces.” (al Si’aya 2/257 Suhail academy)

"Abu Umamah narrates that Nabi was asked: Which dua is most heard? Nabi replied: The dua made in the last third of the night and the dua after Fardh salah.” (Tirmidhi 2/187 H.M Saeed)
Ml Abdur Raheem Rewari mentions that there is consensus (ijma sukooti) that whilst making dua one should raise his hands. (al Nafais al Margouba 44)

"Maulana Anwar Shah Kashmiri mentioned: Raising the hand in dua is perfection in following the sunnah, the sunnah (of dua) could also be attained without raising the hands. Therefore there is no reason to call the one who raises his hands an innovator. Likewise there is no reason to call the one who does not raise his hands an ignorant person." (al Nafais al Margouba 31)

Adhkaar and dua’s to be recited after salah.

"Maulana Abdul Hayy Lucknowi mentions that there is consensus amongst the Ulama that it is mustahab to make zikr after salah." (al Si’aya 2/260Suhail academy)

1) عن ثوبان مولى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم كان إذا انسى من صلاته استغير ثلاثا وقال اللهم أنت السلام ومنك السلام تبارك يا هذا الجلال والإكرام

Thawban narrates that when Nabi used to finish salah He used to recite Istighfaar thrice and then recite:

اللهم أنت السلام ومنك السلام تبارك يا هذا الجلال والإكرام

"O Allah You are peace and from You is peace. Blessed are You o the being of Majesty and Honour"

2) قال حدثني أبو الزبير قال سمعت عبد الله بن الزبير يحدث عن هذا المدل وهو يقول كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إذا سلم يقول لا إله إلا الله وحده لا شريك له لله الملك وله الحمد وهو على كل شيء قدير لا حول ولا قوة إلا بالله إلا الله لا تعبد إلا إياه أهل النعمة والفضل والثناء الحسن

Abdullah bin Zubayr reports that Nabi used after making salam would recite:
“There is no deity but Allah, He has no partner, for Him is the kingdom, for Him is all praise and He has power over all things. We do not worship except Him, the Being of bounty, virtue and praise. There is no deity but Allah with sincere devotion to Him even though the disbelievers detest it.”

Mughira رضي الله تعالى عنه narrates that Nabi ﷺ used to recite after Salah:

الله لا إله إلا الله وحده لا شريك له للملك وله الحمد وهو على كل شيء قدير اللهم لا نعس ولا ننام عفواً غفراً بارك الرحمن

“Glory O Allah and all praise, I seek Your pardon and return to You.”
Uqba reports that Nabi ordered me to recite Surah Ikhlas, Surah Falaq and Surah Nas after every salah. There are many other dua’s and tasbeehat to be recited after salah, for example Ayat al Kursi, Tasbeeh Fatimi etc but we shall suffice on the above mentioned narrations.

**Congregational dua.**

At the outset it should be understood that congregational dua in itself is not prohibited. Due to external factors, as will be mentioned scholars have decreed that it should not be done regularly. It is the responsibility of the Ulama and learned scholars to educate the general public regarding the viewpoint of our pious predecessors regarding this masla.

قال الشيخ انور كشميري رحمه الله تعالى:

واما الامور المحدثة من عقد صورة الجماعة للدعاء كجماعة الصلاة و الانكار على تاركها و نصب امام ثم اتمام به فيه و غير ذلك فكل ذلك من قلة العلم و كثرة الجهل و الجاهل اما مفرط او مفرط او الله الموفق للصواب (اللفائض المرغوبة 31).

Maulana Anwar Shah Kasmiri رحمه الله تعالى mentions: “As for the innovation of making congregational dua like the congregation of salah, condemning the one who leaves it out, appointing an imam then following him etc is all this is due to lack of knowledge and extreme ignorance.”

Maulana Anwar Shah Kasmiri رحمه الله تعالى mentions:

واعلم ان السنة الاكثرية بعد الصلاة الانصرف الى البيوت بدون مكث الا بقدر خروج النساء و كان في الادكاز كل امير نفسه و لم يثبت شاكلة الجماعة فيها كما هو معروف الان (دعاء بعد الفروض 13).

“Every person could make his Adhkar after salah as he wish. Doing it in congregation, as is common nowadays is not an established practice.”

At another place he also mentions:
Know very well that congregating and raising the hands as is a common practice was unknown in the time of Nabi ﷺ.

"Yes, dua after fardh is established but individually not in congregation."

Maulana Yusuf Binori رحمه الله تعالى mentions: “Even though at times congregational dua took place but this was not the common regular practice of Nabi ﷺ nor the sahaba. It only took place on some special occasions (like when in war or istisqa etc) Had it been practiced it would have been narrated by numerous narrators. An action carried out five times a days in public, how is it possible that no one mentions it. General Ahadeeth cannot be used to prove something at a specific time.”

Darul Iftaa – Madrassah Inaamiyyah, Camperdown
Mufti Faydullah mentions: "The fourth method of making dua is that after the fardh salah every body makes dua in congregation whilst lifting their hands. This has totally no basis in the Shariah. It is not established from the practices of our pious predecessors, neither is it established from any Hadith, be it Saheeh, Da'eef or even Maudhoo' nor is it established from the writing of any Jurist. Most definitely this is an innovaton."

Mufti Muhammed Ebrahim Sadiq Abadi says: "The Imam and muqaddi's making congregational dua is an innovation which took its roots longer after the time of Nabi ﷺ. From the whole treasure of Ahadeeth, there is not even one narration to support this. Neither is there any reference of this from the Sahaba, Tabee or A'immah mujtahideen. To the contrary sound narrations, consensus of the scholars of all four madhabs and sound reasons gives preference to individual dua."
Mufti Shafi said: "Looking at the negative effects of congregational dua, no madhab or school of thought can possibly give permission for it. Some of its negative effects are:

1. When the imam makes dua and the followers say ameen it appears as though the imam is the linking rope between Allah Ta’ala and his servants.

2. The habit of many imams is to read the dua in arabic, and in most cases the imam himself does not understand what he is asking from Allah Ta’ala.

3. One of the wrongs that are found is that besides the common needs of the people, each person has his own individual needs. The imam is singing his previously memorized words and the crowd is saying "ameen", that is why the most preferable way is that each person makes his own individual dua, and ask for his needs in the language that he understands.

4. The greatest wrong is that the imam reads the words of dua loudly while most of the time there are late comers still completing their salah and they are distracted in their salaat. That is why it is not narrated from Rasulullah ﷺ nor from the sahabah ﷺ nor from the tabeeen that collective dua after salah was made."

"The conclusion is that the habitual way of dua is against the manner of dua taught to us by the Quran and Sunnah, and is contrary to the lifestyle of Nabi ﷺ and his companions. Therefore, in normal cases it should be abstained from. The imam and the congregation should make their own silent individual duas. Yes, if a special occasion comes about and these harms are not found then there is no harm to make loud collective dua."

"As for congregational dua, as is common nowadays where after salam the imam raises his hands and makes duas and the muqadda’s says ameen, this practice was not found in the time of Nabi ﷺ like how Ibn Qayyim has mentioned."
Mufi Rasheed Ahmed says: "The experiences regarding the habitual dua

1. People began regarding it as sunnat of salah.

2. The common people began holding so firm onto it, that they regard the person who omits it worthy of being rebuked. If an imam does not do it in this way he is discharged from his leadership.

3. Despite the consenses of opinion regarding silent dua being the best, still too loud dua is insisted upon.

Based on these reasons the habit of loud dua after the salaat should be banned from the masajid, and the ulama should give more attention to this. It is incumbent upon the imams of the masajid to eradicate the custom of loud dua and to propagate to the congregation that collective dua is not a sunnat. It should therefore not be given so much importance. Rasulullah ﷺ performed the five daily salaat with the congregation in front of all. If he ever did the dua with the congregation someone would definitely have narrated it. But that is not the case. In the treasures of ahadeeth there is not the slightest sign of it. Even if it is accepted to be a mustahab, to make it permanently is a bidat."

On been questioned regarding the congregational supplication after the Fardh Salaah in a loud tone Mufti Taqi Ithmani Saheb answers as follows:

"Congregational supplication; is never reported to be performed by the Holy Prophet ﷺ in the manner explained in your question. It appears from the relevant ahadeeth that in the days of the Holy Prophet ﷺ he used to pray on his own; even after salah. But at the same time there is no clear injunction in the Holy Qur’aan or in the Sunnah which prohibits such congregational supplications. In view of both these aspects, the correct
position is that the congregational supplications are neither a sunnah nor something prohibited. It is only one of the several permissible ways of performing supplication ".

" However, if somebody takes this congregational method as obligatory or as a sunnah of the Holy Prophet ﷺ, then this wrong concept will render this practice a " bid’ah " ( innovation ), hence impermissible, because a practice which was not obligatory or a sunnah at the time of the Holy Prophet ﷺ cannot be held as such after him. It will be a self-coined addition to the prescribed ways of worship, which is termed as bid’ah in the words of the Holy Prophet ﷺ and is strictly prohibited.

" In the light of this principle, if the congregational way of supplication is adopted only for the convenience for the audience, without taking this particular manner as an obligatory method or a sunnah of the Holy Prophet ﷺ it is quite in order in the Shariah. But if this method is observed with a belief of its being obligatory or a sunnah, it is not allowed " . " It is noticed that where congregational supplications are permanently observed, it sometimes creates an impression that such collective supplications is a necessary part of the salah, since this impression is not correct, as discussed earlier, it is advisable to avoid congregational form of supplication at frequent occasions, and to educate the people about the correct position as mentioned above."

(Contemporary Fatawa Pg 32 - 33 )

Sheikh Abdul Haq Delhwi رحمه الله تعالى said: "This habit which is common in both the Arab and non Arab world that the imams of the mosques and the congregation make the dua, the imam recites the dua and the congregation says ameen, this is not from the practice of Nabi صلى الله عليه وسلم and is not substantiated by any hadith. It has been regarded as a bidah hasana."

Sheikh Allamah al Muhaddith al Muhqqiq Maulana Khaleel Ahmed Sahpanpury رحمه الله تعالى said: "There is no reasonable proof for lifting the hands when the shafi or hanafi imaams make dua after salah. And there is no regard of the permissibility given by Ibn Hajar al Makki رحمه الله تعالى ."
(ولا حجة لهم فيما ورد من الترغيب العام في الدعاء بعد كل صلوة فرضا كانت أو نافلة؛ فإنهم ليس فيهن يكون هذا الدعاء للجماعة والاجتماع؛ ولا فيما قاله الشربيني في نور الإيضاح وشرحه بعد قوله: القيام إلى اداء السنة التي تلي الفرض متصل بالفقرة مسًّنون ما نصه. ويستحب للامام بعد سلامه أن يتحول إلى جهة يساره لتطوع بعد الفرض؛ ويستحب أن يستقبل بعده ويستغفر الله ثلاث؛ ويتركون المعوذات وآية الكرسي ويسبحون الله ويحمدوه ويكرون ثلاث وثلاثين ثم يدعون لنفسهم وهم المسلمين وباقيهم ابديهم السأل فإنها ل دالة في على قرائه كل ذلك والدعاء بعدها مجتمعة؛ وأن يفعل ذلك كله في المسجى فإن صيحة الجمع لا تستدعي الاجتماع والعاصحاب ءا صلة؛ نص على ذلك الإصوليون؛ فمن يبيه كلامه أن المسلمين ينبغي لهم قراءة الأوراد الماوردة بعد المكونات بان يأتي كل واحد بها على حدة؛ ويدعوا كل احد بعدها لنفسه المسلمين؛ لأن الشربيني نفسه قد نص قبل ذلك على أن الأفضل بالسنادية فيماهما وأجمع من السبعة؛ إجماع للمخلوقين؛ سواليفي بيته أو غيره

(اعلان السنن ج 3 ص 204-205)

مراجع
Maulana Zafar Ahmed Thanvi

"And there is no proof for them (those who permit congregational dua) in those narrations which are narrated with regards to the general encouragement of dua after salah, be it fardh or nafl salah, because there is no mention that this dua should be with the congregation and that one should wait for it. There is no proof for them also in what Allamah Shurunbulali has said and explained in Noor-ul-Ihdaath that to stand immediately after the fardh salah for the respective sunnah salah is sunnah. He said it is mustahab for the imam after making salaam to turn towards his left for the nafl salah after fardh. It is mustahab that he faces the people after that whilst they all read istighfaar 3 times, 'muawazaat' (suraah al-falaq and suraah an-naas), ayatul kursie, subhaanallahi, alhamdulilah and allah-u-akbar 33 times each, thereafter they will make dua for themselves and for all muslims at large, with their hands raised up.........there is no proof in this that they should all read this, make dua collectively and do it in the masjid because the plural tense does not denote upon congregation at all, as the jurists have clarified. Therefore the meaning of his words would be that all muslims should carry out this prescription after the faradh salah individually thereafter each one should individually make dua for himself and all muslims at large. Shurunbulali (ra) has himself clarified that it is best to perform the sunnah salah in a manner which keeps one far away from pride, which is more conducive to sincerity, be it at home or elsewhere."

Darul Iftaa – Madrassah Inaamiyyah, Camperdown
At another place he mentions: “In many places congregational dua after the fardh salah whilst raising the hands has become common. This was not found in the time of Nabi صلى الله عليه وسلم especially when it is done persistently. Yes, many duas have been established, but it is without lifting of the hands and without being in congregation.”

Maulana Manzoor Numani رحمه الله تعالى mentions: “The practice whereby after salam the muqtadi follows the imam like in salah to such an extent that even if a person is in a hurry and he still considers it unacceptable to leave before the imam; has no basis and needs to be rectified. The link between the imam and muqtadi ends with salam therefore it is not necessary to follow the imam in dua. If he wishes he could make a short dua and leave before the imam and if he wishes he could make a long dua as he wishes.”
Mufti Shafi mentions: “The muqtadi only saying ameen has not been narrated from Nabi ﷺ nor the sahaba, tabieen or ulama. In short this method goes against the teachings of the Quran, the sunnah of Rasulullah ﷺ and the sahaba ﷺ. In such conditions the imam and muqtadi should make silent dua.”

Maulana Maseehullah Khan mentions: “As for a situation where people persist on loud dua and condemn those who leave it out, then should one follow this practice or not? By pondering over the rules of shariah, if we find any action being mustahab and people consider it to be sunnah or wajib then such actions should be prevented. Many examples of this are found in the books of fiqh. The first example is sajda shukr i.e. making sajda upon receiving
any bounty from Allah Ta’ala. Although this has been established in the hadeeth then too Imam Abu Hanifa 

mentions that it is makrooh. According to Allamah Shami the only reason for this is the possibility of people considering it to be wajib. ... It is clear from this that if the possibility of considering any permissible or mustahab act as wajib then such acts should be prohibited. In a similar manner loud dua at most could be permissible. Holding on to it in such a manner that the opposite does not take place at all and condemning the one who leaves it out are signs to show that it has been taken as wajib. Therefore it is necessary to leave it out.”

“After compiling the above I found the same thing mentioned in Tafseer Roohul Ma’ani, namely that loud dua, especially in the masjid, is an innovation. It is mentioned in a Hadeeth “Every innovation is means of misguidance and every misguidance leads to hell.” The text of Ruhul Ma’ani is: You will find many people in your era making loud dua especially in the big masjids not realising that they have combined two innovations the first of raising the voice and the second it being in the masjid.”

Question: Should one say amen to the dua made by the imam after salah or can one make his own dua? 

Answer: One can make whatever dua he wishes. It is not necessary to follow the imam.
"Imam Malik رحمه الله تعالى and a group of other ulama opine that it is makrooh for the imam to make loud dua for those present as this will lead to the imam being the leader of the salah and he will also become the link between Allah Ta’ala and his bondsmen in them attaining their needs."

"I prefer for the imam and muqtadi to make zikr after salah and they should make it silently."

"After fardh salah the dua should be short, carried out individually and softly. Every person should ask for his own needs. The Arabic dua’s should not be always read out loud."

"Loud dua is an innovation."
"It should be noted that the common practice after fardh salah whereby the imam and muqtadi congregate and lift their hands and the imam makes dua and the muqtadi says ameen has definitely not been established from Nabi ﷺ nor the sahaba ﷺ. No hadeeth has been established in this regard."
It is mentioned in Ma’ariful Quran: “May Allah guide the imams of our masjids. They left the teachings of the Quran, sunnah and practices of our pious predecessors. After every salah superficial dua takes place, in raised voices besides going against the etiquettes of dua it also causes disturbance in the salah of the late comers.”

Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanwi mentions: “Continual practice on something is not prohibited. However, dogmatically obligating something on oneself or pragmatically is prohibited. Dogmatic obligation is considering something necessary and pragmatic obligation is when one condemns those who leave it out.”

Ibn Jarir narrates from Ibn Jurayj: “Raising the voice in dua is a form of transgressing the limits as indicated to by the verse verily Allah does not love those who transgress the bounds.”

Sheikh Abdul Fattah mentions: “Yes if anybody considers this (congregational dua whilst raising the hands) as a sunnah and persists on it and condemns the one who leaves it out, then this is incorrect and unacceptable.”
And Allah knows best

Wassalam

Ml. Ishaq E. Moosa,
Student Darul Iftaa

Checked and Approved by:

Mufti Ebrahim Desai
Darul Iftaa, Madrassah In’aamiyyah

The ulama should first educate their congregation on the sunnah method of Adhkaar after salah and gradually inform them that the congregational dua is not compulsory and was not practised at the time of Rasulullah ﷺ. Get the congregation to first understand that congregational dua is mubah and not compulsory. Do not condemn the practice without educating the congregation. This will lead to fitna.